### **Ceased Circumstances' Cessation Clauses: Making Gender Visible**



#### Natasha Yacoub University of London, Refugee Law Initiative

Women in Refugee Law, Fifth Public Seminar 10-11-2025

### **Overview of presentation**

- Introduction: Cessation as Punishment?
- Part 1 Law: 'Ceased circumstances' cessation
- Part 2 Legal criteria
- Part 3 Dynamic interpretation of cessation
- Conclusion: Cessation as Protection

### Introduction Cessation as Punishment

- Ends refugee status (individual or prima facie) in country of asylum
- Asylum country to determine (often with UNHCR assistance)
- Not a durable solution
- Dynamic interpretation using international human rights
- Legal requirement to include gender
- □ *Travaux* (working documents) 1951 Conv and women's needs

#### PART 1

### **'Ceased circumstances'** cessation clauses

## Legal criteria 'ceased circumstances' cessation

- Articles 1C(5) and (6) of the1951 UN Refugee Convention
- Article I(4)(e) OAU Convention
- Article 6(iv) AALCO Bangkok Principles



Other

# Law Article 1C(5) and (6) UN Convention

Articles 1C(5) and (6) provides that the 1951 UN Refugee Convention shall cease to apply to any person falling under the terms of Article 1(A) if:

He [or she] can no longer, because the **circumstances in connexion with which he [or she] has been recognized as a refugee** have ceased to exist, continue to refuse to avail himself [or herself] of the protection of the country of his [or her] nationality [or former habitual residence];

Provided that this paragraph shall **not apply to a refugee falling under section A(1) of this Article who is able to invoke compelling reasons** arising out of previous persecution for refusing to avail himself [or herself] of the protection of the country of nationality [or former habitual residence].

## Law Other: General IL Principles / IHRL

General principles of international law:
 principle of state sovereignty, international cooperation

☐ International human rights law: dynamic interpretation of cessation

#### PART 2

### Legal Criteria for Ceased Circumstances Cessation

Under-development, confusion and the invisibility of gender

## Legal Criteria: Cessation for 'Ceased Circumstances'

- (i) Change in the country of origin fundamental, stable and durable
- removal of the threat of persecution causing flight mirror to the refugee definition (restrictive approach of Australia/Germany)
- (iii) removal of persecution + adequate protection 'double guarantee', 'Hoxha & Anor (UK, 2005), also UNHCR
- (iv) 'compelling reasons' exception
  grave violations, humanitarian principle (UNHCR)

### Legal Criteria 'underdeveloped'

Both the texts and state practice to interpret the ceased circumstances clauses are 'underdeveloped'

Joan Fitzpatrick, 1999 Georgia Cole, 2021

The ceased circumstances clause is 'troublesome in its application': objective assessment of change, procedural fairness, exceptions

Siddiqi, 2011

# Legal Criteria: confusion and inconsistency

- If, how and when cessation for `ceased circumstances' should be triggered (eg CAR)
- Confusion about UNHCR's role to trigger cessation
- Whether an individual determination is required
  - Individual process required but rare, not a de novo hearing, UNHCR Guidelines, 2003, para 18.
- Diverging legal tests

# Interpretation of legal criteria: Invisibility of Gender

- Invisibility of gender in academic commentary, state practice, UNHCR guidance documents (1997, 1999, 2003), key Executive Committee Conclusions on cessation (No. 65 (XLII) of 1991, No. 69 (XLIII) of 1992)
- No/limited reference in tripartite agreements (UNHCR, country origin, country asylum) have limited references to 'sex', 'gender', 'woman'/'women' eg 'go and see' visits
- Refugee women do not meaningfully participate in decisions to invoke cessation of refugee status on a group basis.

#### PART 3

### Dynamic Interpretation of 'Ceased Circumstances' Cessation Clause

**Making Gender Visible** 

# Dynamic interpretation: international human rights law

- There is requirement that the 'ceased circumstance' clause be interpreted in light of international human rights law (academic commentary eg Foster; UNHCR; and Executive Committee conclusions)
- International refugee law can better protect women's rights using a dynamic interpretation: drawing on international human rights law
  - Querton

#### **Conclusion: Cessation as Protection**

- The appropriate **substantive legal test must include all four elements** (change in the country of origin, absence of persecution, availability of protection, exceptions for compelling reasons)
- The procedure to trigger cessation for changed circumstances may be done on a group basis but there must be a **gendersensitive individual process** for those who have ongoing protection needs
- Cessation for ceased circumstances can have dire consequences if applied incorrectly, and international protection designed to protect can perpetuate oppression
- A dynamic interpretation of cessation using international human rights law includes gender considerations.

### **Further Reading**

Yacoub Natasha 'Women's Rights and the Criteria for Cessation of Refugee Status for 'Ceased Circumstances'

https://unsworks.unsw.edu.au/entities/publication/606c4ca8-f3f1-4836-86bb-d774b5c5c8bc/full

Yacoub, Natasha, 'Feminist Approaches to Recenter Humanity in International Migration Law', in J. Jarpa Dawuni, and others (eds), *The Oxford Handbook of Women and International Law*, Oxford Handbooks (January 2026)

https://doi-org.wwwproxy1.library.unsw.edu.au/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780197653647.013.0041



Thank you